Hybrid learning
International experiences with multimodal approaches

July 2022

@GlobalEdTechHub  edtechhub.org
About this document

Recommended citation


Licence

Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/. You — dear readers — are free to share (copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format) and adapt (remix, transform, and build upon the material) for any purpose, even commercially. You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made. You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.

Notes

EdTech Hub is supported by UK aid (Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office), Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, World Bank, and UNICEF. The views expressed in this document do not necessarily reflect the views of UK aid (Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office), Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, World Bank, and UNICEF.

Acknowledgement

This report was commissioned by UNICEF and produced under UNICEF and EdTech Hub’s global partnership. Many thanks to UNICEF El Salvador colleagues, including Marta Navarro, Marta Isabel Gomez and Jaime Ayala for their support and input to develop this report.

About the EdTech Hub Helpdesk

The Helpdesk is the Hub’s rapid response service, available to FCDO advisers and World Bank staff in 70 low- and lower-middle-income countries (LMICs) and UNICEF regional and country offices. It delivers just-in-time services to support education technology planning and decision-making. We respond to most requests in 1–15 business days. Given the rapid nature of requests, we aim to produce comprehensive and evidence-based quality outputs, while acknowledging that our work is by no means exhaustive. For more information, please visit https://edtechhub.org/edtech-hub-helpdesk/
Agenda

1. Introduction
2. Presentation: Hybrid learning and international experiences with a multimodal approach
3. Questions
4. Interactive session: group discussions
5. Group presentations
6. Closing
Introduction

This slide deck was originally developed for a webinar series on blended and hybrid learning for UNICEF El Salvador and the El Salvador Ministry of Education. It was informed by findings and insights from the EdTech Hub report, *Blended and Hybrid Learning Initiatives: A curated list for El Salvador*. A spanish version of this material is also available and can be accessed [here](#).
Presentations

Mario Alexis Ruiz Mejía
Manager of teaching and leadership professional development
National Directorate of Teacher Training

Jaime Ayala
Education officer
UNICEF — El Salvador
EdTech Hub Team

EdTech Hub experts:

Christina Myers
EdTech Hub Researcher

Alejandra Vijil
EdTech Hub Analyst

Xuzel Villavicencio
EdTech Hub Analyst
Today’s Purpose

- Understand the characteristics and differences between blended and hybrid learning
- Understand the socio-emotional aspect in the use of technology-based learning
- Learn about the different EdTech tools used in El Salvador
- Learn about effective practices for implementing hybrid learning
Why is it important to learn about blended and hybrid learning in El Salvador?

Covid-19
- Education disruptions

Links with education
- Students
- Teachers
- Connectivity
- Technical support

Multimodal education
- Content created to be adapted to different technologies

Strengthen teaching methods to help teachers become more comfortable using various technological tools and platforms
Features of blended and hybrid learning
Terminology

**Blended Learning**
- A combination of in-person and digital learning
- Historically taught as part of a physical experience in a classroom

**Hybrid Learning**
- Involves the combination of in-person learning and remote learning
- It is not necessarily taught in a traditional classroom

Used interchangeably during the pandemic to refer to a mix of in-person and remote learning.
Features of hybrid learning

- **Synchronous** vs **asynchronous** activities
  - **Synchronous**: occur “in real time”
  - **Asynchronous**: occur at different times and/or sequentially

- **Face-to-face / in-person** vs **remote** activities
  - **Face-to-face / in-person**: occur with students and teachers in the same physical space
  - **Remote**: occur when two or more people are in different locations physically
Features of hybrid learning

Direction of communication — the communication flow in hybrid learning can be varied and includes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>One-way</strong></td>
<td>Unidirectional communication in which teachers deliver lesson content without opportunity for students to reciprocate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bi-directional</strong></td>
<td>Typically takes place when the teacher communicates to the student (as the first direction) and the student communicates back to the teacher (second direction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multi-directional</strong></td>
<td>Occurs when teachers communicate with students, and students communicate with teachers and their peers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Features of hybrid learning

Level of participation — hybrid learning can be typified by three types of participation:

- **No participation**: a learning situation in which an individual learns alone without interacting with others

- **Limited participation**: a learning situation in which interaction is limited, structured, or controlled

- **High participation**: a situation in which active and dynamic exchange with others is prioritised
Challenges and opportunities of hybrid learning
Balance between remote and face-to-face classes

There is no approach that applies to all contexts.

Teachers are best positioned to understand the limitations of each context.

There are various technologies, tools, and types of hybrid learning.

Empower teachers to choose the best hybrid learning alternative.
Technology and the early years of school

Emotional well-being
Support caregivers and/or teachers in the use of technological tools, and in the promotion of emotional well-being

Use various technologies for different kinds of activities

Game-based learning can include using and supporting:

- Exploration
- Decision-making
- Peer interaction
- Resources and materials that are already at home
Social-emotional Learning (SEL): Is the process of acquiring and applying knowledge, attitudes, and skills that allow people to perform optimally in educational and professional fields.

**Intended Outcomes of SEL**

- Increased capacity to manage emotions
- Development of healthy identities
- Developed sense of empathy
- Form and maintain supportive relationships
- Define and achieve personal goals
- Make responsible decisions

**Technology and SEL**

- Integrated SEL in technology-enabled programmes that focus on numeracy and literacy skills
- Technology embedded in programmes that focus on promoting SEL.
Technology and social-emotional learning
Benefits of incorporating digital tools into SEL

- It makes content more accessible and supports game-based learning.
- It opens new possibilities for engaging students, parents and teachers.
- It provides a less intimidating virtual space in which to practise prosocial behaviours.
Connectivity in El Salvador
ICT Infrastructure and connectivity in El Salvador

- Fixed subscriptions: 13.84%
- Mobile subscriptions: 8.07%
- Broadband: 43%
- Total: 161%
ICT Infrastructure and connectivity in El Salvador

95.7% 45.3% 25.4% 23.6% 14.9%

Devices used to access the internet
ICT infrastructure and connectivity in El Salvador during the Covid-19 pandemic

- Social media used during the pandemic:
  - WhatsApp: 90.5%
  - Facebook: 85.2%
  - YouTube: 69.9%
  - Instagram: 60.8%

- Consumption of TV and radio during the pandemic:
  - 43%
  - 63%
This means hybrid learning in El Salvador should not only include online tools, but use **multiple technology modalities** to reach as many students as possible.
Examples of hybrid learning
Insights for policymakers and educators
Examples of hybrid learning

How we selected them:

- Focus on **pre-primary and primary** education
- Highlight effective blended / hybrid learning practices
- Pay special attention to **how educators adapt** to and implement multimodal learning
- Consider **multimodal approaches**, particularly low-tech interventions (TV and radio)
- Originate from countries with **varying levels of access to ICT devices**
- Use ‘Google Classrooms’
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name and Link</th>
<th>Plan Ceibal</th>
<th>Rising on Air</th>
<th>Education Media Center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td>West Africa</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Level</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary</td>
<td>Primary and Secondary</td>
<td>Pre-primary, Primary and Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modality</td>
<td>Laptops, radio, television (TV)</td>
<td>Radio, mobile phones (SMS)</td>
<td>Smartphones, TV, printed textbooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Characteristics</td>
<td><a href="#">Image</a></td>
<td><a href="#">Image</a></td>
<td><a href="#">Image</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Plan Ceibal

Description: Plan Ceibal helped provide education continuity during the Covid-19 pandemic by combining teaching through television, radio, and online resources in its programme ‘Ceibal en casa’

Insights for policymakers

- Ensure communities (caregivers, teachers, students, education leaders) are engaged / involved in the process of including technology in education
- Develop new requirements for teachers, students, and families
- Cultivate spaces (physical & virtual) for knowledge sharing to encourage cultural shifts in education systems
- Use a multimodal approach for greater accessibility
- Diversify evaluation and monitoring
Plan Ceibal

Insights for educators

- Plan Ceibal is part of Red REA (Recursos educacionales abiertos) and offers a platform to guide teachers in creating their own content
- Review content and resources created by other teachers
- Combine resources from differentes sources and adapt them to the needs of each teacher
- Reuse already existing resources
- Redistribute and share resources with other teachers
Plan Ceibal

It was about learning English while you played and had fun.

GRACIAS
familias y docentes
por su confianza
Rising on Air

Description: A network of schools that use blended learning approaches, combining low-cost technology with modern teaching practices. They created a programme (Rising on Air) in response to school closures, which uses radio and SMS content for parents.

Insights for policymakers

- Focus on foundational literacy and numeracy skills to promote access and equity
- Covering too many subjects / grade levels drives up the cost of developing content
- Radio alone is unlikely to be effective. Consider other supplemental strategies
- A range of distribution channels should be considered
Rising on Air

**Insights for educators**

- Use existing content and supplement from additional sources.
- Develop and test content to determine what works for your audience.
- Monitor your progress weekly to allow for course correction as needed.
Rising on Air

**TEACHER:** Elsiemae Melanie Buckley
**SUBJECT:** Mathematics
**LEVEL:** Grade 1-3

**TEACHERS:** Aaron T. Ballah & J. Krubo D. K. Solomon
**SUBJECT:** Math
**TOPIC:** Adding 3-Digit Numbers By Regrouping in Two Places
**School Level:** 2 Lower Basic Primary, Grades 3 & 4
**Lesson #19**
**Education Media Center**

**Description:** Produces app-based educational content, broadcasts educational classes on public TV, and provides printed textbooks for students in low-resource settings.

**Insights for policymakers**

- Strong leadership is key to mobilising resources and rapid implementation
- Stakeholder communication is vital to meet pandemic-driven demands
- Partnerships with companies / non-profit organisations helps avoid bureaucratic procedural delays
- Multimodal learning activities are necessary for reaching the maximum number of students and families
- Developing teacher and student email accounts is important for engaging a large school system
Insights for educators

- A process whereby teachers can report challenges is vital when implementing hybrid learning and when trying to reach students.
- Having pedagogical advisors to review teachers’ virtual classroom plans is key to giving feedback to teachers before broadcasting a class and to improve the quality of the content.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tipo de Formação</th>
<th>Canal/App</th>
<th>Horário</th>
<th>Área de Conhecimento</th>
<th>Título</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Desenvolvimento Profissional 1</td>
<td>08:00 - 09:00</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>A Educação de Jovens e Adultos na Rede Estadual de Ensino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>08:30 - 09:15</td>
<td>Ciências da Natureza. Anos Iniciais</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais - Ciências: Que som é esse?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>09:30 - 10:15</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>Temas Complementares Anos Iniciais: Comunicação SP - Rede Protetica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>11:30 - 12:15</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais: ING. Multilateral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Desenvolvimento Profissional 1</td>
<td>13:00 - 13:40</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>A Educação de Jovens e Adultos na Rede Estadual de Ensino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>14:30 - 15:15</td>
<td>Ciências da Natureza. Anos Iniciais</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais - Ciências: Que som é esse?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>15:45 - 16:30</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>Temas Complementares Anos Iniciais: Comunicação SP - Rede Protetica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Formação de Professores</td>
<td>17:30 - 18:15</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais</td>
<td>Anos Iniciais: ING. Multilateral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - ATPC</td>
<td>Desenvolvimento Profissional 1</td>
<td>19:00 - 19:40</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>A Educação de Jovens e Adultos na Rede Estadual de Ensino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formação - Cursos e Pós-Cursos</td>
<td>Formação de Práticas Desportivas</td>
<td>08:30 - 09:04</td>
<td>Temas complementares</td>
<td>Módulo 1 - Básico: características e componentes do jogo.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Takeaways
## Takeaways for policymakers

1. **Consultation with teachers**
   - Create spaces for teachers to share and transfer effective practices and concerns.

2. **Build long-term partnerships**
   - Partnerships between government, private and the third sector (NGOs) could facilitate the implementation of hybrid learning.

3. **Ensure accessibility and inclusion**
   - Include students who speak indigenous languages and/or who have a type of disability.

4. **Multimodal approach**
   - Consider alternative modalities to bring education as close as possible to those students who are hardest to reach.

5. **Regular data collection**
   - Gather, analyse and use data to monitor and evaluate the progress of hybrid learning.
Takeaways for educators

1. Create your own content
2. Adapt and test content with the classroom
3. Review your own and other teachers’ resources
4. Share your resources and concerns
5. Correct resources as needed
Thank you